

Reviewer 1 Report

Manuscript title: Between Critique and Growth: Teachers' Meaning-Making of School Administrators' Observation Feedback

Version: 1

Comments:

The manuscript discusses teachers' meaning-making of classroom observation feedback using Colaizzi's phenomenological approach. This is a relevant and timely contribution to supervisory practices in education. The writing is generally clear and the phenomenological voice is maintained; however, some methodological and conceptual refinements would strengthen the rigor and clarity.

Major

1. As the topic deals with subjective experiences and power relations between administrators and teachers, a reflexivity statement is expected. Please clarify the researcher's positionality (Was the researcher a teacher, administrator, supervisor?) and how bias was managed.
2. The paper states "NVivo software (or manual coding) was utilized." This phrasing suggests uncertainty. Please specify which was actually used.
3. Saturation is mentioned at the 10th participant but lacks explanation of how it was determined (no new themes? repetition in responses?). One sentence would suffice.
4. Seven themes are reported; however, some overlap (Themes 1 and 5 on emotions may be collapsed; Themes 1 and 7 overlap on growth). Consider refining for conciseness.
5. Current discussion mainly confirms literature. More critical stance could be added: Did any results contradict existing studies? Were there unique Philippine cultural findings (e.g., "hiya," respect for authority)? This would highlight originality.

Minor

1. The introduction is strong but could benefit from a clear statement of research questions at the end.
2. Remove repeated text in Ethical Considerations.
3. Check punctuation: "feedbacking" is colloquial and appears in participant quotes, appropriate in quotations but avoid in narrative.
4. Consider adding age/teaching years as a small demographic table in Results.

Overall recommendation: Accept with major revisions.

Reviewer 2 Report

Manuscript title: Between Critique and Growth: Teachers' Meaning-Making of School Administrators' Observation Feedback

Version: 1

Comments:

This is a beautifully written and meaningful paper. It captures the human reality of teaching—the fear, vulnerability, reflection, and transformation that come with classroom observations. The voice of teachers is authentic and the use of phenomenology is well-justified and consistently integrated.

Major

1. Insert research questions clearly. At the end of the Introduction, explicitly state the research questions. Ex:

- How do teachers experience classroom observation feedback?
- How do they interpret and act upon it?

2. Practical recommendations could be more concrete.

You already suggest training for administrators. You might add examples such as:

- “Use two-part feedback: affirmation + instructional suggestion.”
- “Allow teachers reflection time before requiring written responses.”

3. End the conclusion with inspiration / call to action. A sentence like: “Feedback should not end in evaluation, but begin in support.” would leave a memorable close.

Minor

1. Add a short reflexive statement. A sentence like: “As a teacher-researcher, I maintained a reflective journal to examine my assumptions during data collection and analysis.” This enhances transparency.

Overall recommendation: Accept with minor revisions.

Reviewer 1 Report

Manuscript title: Between Critique and Growth: Teachers' Meaning-Making of School Administrators' Observation Feedback

Version: 2

Comments:

Revisions are substantially complied. The paper is now recommended for publication.

Reviewer 2 Report

Manuscript title: Between Critique and Growth: Teachers' Meaning-Making of School Administrators' Observation Feedback

Version: 2

Comments:

Revisions are substantially complied. The paper is now recommended for publication.